

1 BARRETT S. LITT, SBN 45527
2 Email: blitt@kmbllaw.com
3 KAYE, MCLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT
4 234 Colorado Boulevard, Suite 230
5 Pasadena, California 91101
6 Telephone: (626) 844-7660
7 Facsimile: (626) 844-7670

8 CAROL A. SOBEL, SBN 84483
9 Email: carolsobel@aol.com
10 LAW OFFICE OF CAROL A. SOBEL
11 3110 Main Street, Suite 210
12 Santa Monica, CA 90405
13 Telephone: (310) 393-3055
14 Facsimile: (310) 451-3858

15 ADDITIONAL COUNSEL LISTED ON NEXT
16 PAGE

17 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

18 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
19 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

20 Charmaine Chua, *et al.*
21 Plaintiffs,
22 vs.
23 City of Los Angeles, *et al.*,
24 Defendants.

Case No. 16-00237-JAK-GJS(x)

[Honorable John A. Kronstadt]

DECLARATION OF CAROL A. SOBEL IN
SUPPORT OF SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF IN
SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR
CLASS CERTIFICATION.

Hearing Date: November 7, 2016

Hearing Time: 8:30 A.M.

Courtroom: 750

Trial Date: N/A

Time: N/A

1 ADDITIONAL PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL

2 SCHONBRUN, SEPLOW, HARRIS & HOFFMAN

3 PAUL HOFFMAN, SBN 71244

4 Email: hoffpaul@aol.com

CATHERINE SWEETSER, SBN 271142

5 Email: catherine.sdshhh@gmail.com

6 732 Ocean Front Walk

Venice, California 90291

7 Telephone: (310) 396-0731

8 Facsimile: (310) 399-7040

9 LAW OFFICE OF COLLEEN FLYNN

10 COLLEEN M. FLYNN, SBN 234281

11 Email: cflynnlaw@yahoo.com

12 3435 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite.2910

Los Angeles, California 90010

13 Telephone: (213) 252-9444

14 Facsimile: (213) 252-0091

15 Matthew Strugar, SBN 232951

16 Email: matthewstrugar@gmail.com

LAW OFFICE OF MATTHEW STRUGAR

17 2108 Cove Avenue

18 Los Angeles, California 90039

19 Telephone: (323) 696-2299

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF CAROL A. SOBEL

I, CAROL SOBEL, declare:

1. I am an attorney admitted to practice before the Supreme Court of California and the United States District Court for the Central District of California. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth below and, if called to testify to them, could and would do so competently.

2. I submitted a declaration in support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification. This supplemental declaration is submitted to address the concerns raised by the Court at the hearing on this motion on Monday, November 7, 2016.

3. I have been involved with the National Lawyers Guild ("NLG") since approximately 1974. Since approximately 1998, my involvement has been very extensive. I served as the president of the Los Angeles Chapter of the National Lawyers Guild for approximately 10 years beginning in 1998. I was also a member of the National Executive Committee of the National Lawyers Guild in one capacity or another for more than ten years. During most of that time, I also co-chaired the National Lawyers Guild's Mass Defense Committee, which is the entity in the NLG that coordinates the organizations response to protests around the nation.

4. On behalf of the National Lawyers Guild, for the past 16 years, I litigated both damages and injunctive relief cases on behalf of demonstrators whose First Amendment rights were abridged. In addition to the *Aichele* case referenced in our motion, I have done this around the country beginning with the Democratic National Convention ("DNC") in Los Angeles in 2000, the Free

1 Trade Area of the Americas (“FTAA”) in Miami in 2003 and the *MIWON* case in
2 Los Angeles on May Day in 2007.

3 5. In this case, there is no allegation in the complaint that Mr. Todd was
4 singled out because of his role as an NLG legal observer. In the DNC, FTAA and
5 *MIWON* litigation, some of the plaintiffs were NLG legal observers who were
6 arrested by local law enforcement agencies or otherwise subjected to practices
7 challenged as violative of constitutional rights. In each of these cases, the NLG
8 did not make the argument that its legal observers should be treated any
9 differently than other individuals who were unlawfully dispersed, detained,
10 arrested or subjected to excessive force. Only when the NLG legal observers are
11 targeted for selective enforcement do we make this argument. For example, in
12 the Miami FTAA litigation, several of the plaintiffs were NLG legal observers.
13 As counsel in that case, I am aware of the arguments that were made. One of the
14 NLG legal observers who was arrested in that event was standing with reporters
15 and taking notes outside of the dispersal zone when he was targeted by officers,
16 pulled out of that safe area and arrested. More recently, in protests in Phoenix,
17 Arizona after the enactment of anti-immigrant laws there, three individuals
18 wearing identifiable NLG legal observer hats were singled out for arrest from
19 among several dozens of protestors. I reviewed the videos of these events, as well
20 as the lawsuits filed, and also spoke with the lawyers representing the plaintiffs
21 and on that basis I am aware of the facts alleged.

22 6. In fact, three of Plaintiffs’ counsel in this matter have been plaintiffs
23 in similar litigation with non-NLG legal observers but none have ever asserted
24 that, in those cases, they should be treated differently based on their role as legal
25
26
27
28

1 observers. The three attorneys are me in post-DNC litigation in Los Angeles with
2 several plaintiffs who were not present at NLG legal observers, and Matthew
3 Strugar and Colleen Flynn, both of whom I represented in the FTAA litigation in
4 Miami.

5
6 7. The second issue raised by the Court at the November 10, 2016
7 hearing involved the NLG's role as an organizational plaintiff in this matter. The
8 NLG is a member of several coalitions in Los Angeles working on issues raised
9 by this litigation, including the Stop LAPD Spying Coalition, which opposes a
10 broad array of surveillance activities by law enforcement. The NLG is also a
11 member of several coalitions addressing police misconduct issues. As a
12 participant in these and other coalitions, the NLG urges its members to participate
13 in demonstrations organized by the coalitions. The NLG will also provide legal
14 observers for these protests, but only a small number of NLG members fill this
15 role.

16
17 I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.
18 Executed this 10th day of November, 2016 at Santa Monica, California.

19
20 /s/ Carol A. Sobel
21 Carol A. Sobel
22
23
24
25
26
27
28